CSE Harmful Elements Analysis Tool

The CSE Harmful Elements Analysis Tool¹ was created to help parents, school administrators, educators, and other concerned citizens assess, evaluate, and expose harmful elements within comprehensive sexuality education (CSE)² curricula and materials. For more information, visit <u>www.stopcse.org</u>.

Analysis of

Teaching Sexuality and Life Skills A Guide for Teachers Using Our Future Pupils' Books Based on 15 Harmful Elements Commonly Included in CSE Materials

CSE HARMFUL ELEMENTS SCORE = 13 OUT OF 15

Teaching Sexuality and Life Skills contains 13 out of 15 of the harmful elements typically found in CSE curricula or materials. The presence of even one of these elements indicates that the analyzed materials are inappropriate for children. Having several of these elements should disqualify such materials for use with children.

Program Description: This is the teacher's guide for the *Our Future* curriculum. Published and distributed by the International HIV/AIDS Alliance, *Our Future* is a series of three books developed in the Chipata District of Zambia, with the Zambian Ministry of Education, Planned Parenthood Association of Zambia and Young, Happy, Healthy and Safe.

Target Age Group: The Our Future curriculum covers Grades 4-9.

Planned Parenthood Connections: This curriculum is published by the International HIV/AIDS Alliance. On the AIDS Alliance board of directors sits a former president of International Planned Parenthood Federation (IPPF). Former board trustees include multiple high-level officials at IPPF. Planned Parenthood Association of Zambia (PPAZ) helped develop and implement *Our Future*.

HARMFUL CSE ELEMENTS	Excerpted Quotes from CSE Material
1. SEXUALIZES CHILDREN	Children up to 9 years: "We can help them to develop skills and virtues as they are growing up by giving information about and names for their body parts,
Normalizes child sex or desensitizes children to sexual	including sexual and reproductive body parts and what they are used for ." (p. 8)
things. May give examples of children having sex or imply many of their peers are sexually	Note: The discussion of the function of sexual body parts often leads to discussing things such as erections, orgasms, and how to achieve sexual pleasure.
active. May glamorize sex, use graphic materials, teach explicit sexual vocabulary, or encourage discussion of sexual experiences,	"Many teenagers are sexually active and they may not be given or accept the information and services they need to stay safe. They need to know everything they can about sexual and reproductive health and how to stay safe." (p. 9)

¹ The CSE Harmful Elements Analysis Tool was created by Family Watch International. Family Watch is not responsible for the way in which the tool is used by individuals who do independent analyses of CSE materials. Visit <u>www.stopcse.org</u> for a blank template or to see analyses of various CSE materials.

² CSE programs are often labeled as comprehensive sex education, sexual education, sexuality education, anti-bullying programs, sexual and reproductive health education, Welcoming Schools programs, and even family life, life skills or abstinence plus education programs, etc. Regardless of the label, if program materials contain one or more of the 15 harmful elements identified in this analysis tools, such materials should be categorized as CSE and should be removed from use in schools.

attractions fantacios or desires	
attractions, fantasies or desires.	"Some activities ask learners to create their own pictures or posters. Teachers are encouraged to make their own illustrations to adapt or supplement those in the 'Our future' books and to set up a 'Sexuality wall' where learners and teachers can put up their pictures and messages." (p. 48)
	Grade 4, Chapter 3 Aim: "To enable learners to feel comfortable to talk openly about sexual organs, activities and issues without fear of insults." (p. 55)
	Grade 4, Section 3.3 Objective: " Talk openly about sexual organs and what they do without fear." (p. 55)
	"Explain what happens when boys have wet dreams and why they happen ." (p. 55)
	Grade 5, Section 9.2 Objective: "Name three ways of enjoying our sexuality that has no risk of HIV, three that have low risk and one that has high risk." (p. 59)
	Grade 5, Section 9.2 Objective: "Name two sexual activities that are easy to stop before intercourse , two that are difficult to stop and two that are impossible to stop." (p. 59)
	Grade 7, Section 6.2 Objective: "Assertively explain the difference between sex and love. Give examples of sex without love, love without sex and sex and love together ." (p. 63)
	Grade 8, Section 1.1 Objective: "Explain the difference between sexuality and sexual intercourse ." (p. 66)
	"Learners and adults may disagree on what is a violation of rights. For example, adults may say that teaching young people about sex will result in them becoming sexually active. You need to explain that there is no evidence for this when learners learn about the dangers of having early sex and how they can protect themselves. This works better than keeping them in ignorance ." (p. 67)
	Grade 8, Section 2.4 Objective: "Assertively act out resisting a person attempting sexual abuse and reporting it to a trusted adult." (p. 67)
	Grade 9, Section 5.1 Objective: " Explain sexual feelings and name three things that can arouse sexual feelings ." (p. 70)
	Grade 9, Section 5.7 Objective: "Name two problems that a couple may meet in their sexual life." (p. 71)
	Grade 9, Section 6.5 Objective: "Show empathy and kindness in supporting a friend who is having high risk sex to feed herself and her siblings." (p. 71)
2. TEACHES CHILDREN TO	Purposes and objectives for role play: "To practise communication skills – for example, how to say 'No' to sex, how to talk about sex with a partner, how to

"Learners may know more about sexual activities than you imagine, and they may be at risk if they have incorrect ideas. For example, many HIV educators do
may be at risk if they have incorrect ideas. For example, many HIV educators do
not mention anal sex , but this is a high risk activity that some young people do, especially if they wrongly think that it has no risk for both pregnancy and HIV." (p. 13)
"Homosexuality is not accepted in Zambia and it is illegal for men to practice anal sex. This has a negative effect on the lives of people who are attracted to people of their own sex. Stigmatising homosexuality does not make it go away because sexual orientation is mainly decided by our genes – we are born with it . It just makes it a secret activity. If homosexuality is accepted, it will not result in young people copying it, because most of us become more attracted to people of the opposite sex when we grow up. It will just make it possible for people who have same sex partners access information and services and to practice low risk sex and avoid the bad effects of stigma and discrimination." (p. 38) Grade 7, Section 6.2 Objective: "Accept that some of us are attracted to people of our own sex and we also need to protect ourselves from HIV." (p. 63) Grade 9, Chapter 5 Aim: "To reduce stigma towards people with a different sexual orientation ." (p. 70) Grade 9, Section 5.6 Objectives: "Increased understanding of heterosexual and homosexual attraction and behaviours ; Empathise with the difficulties of people who are attracted to people of the same sex in a disapproving society and understand their human rights; Mention three actions that can be taken to
(r "I al pois bit your Good Good Good Good Good Good Good Good

5. PROMOTES SEXUAL PLEASURE Teaches children they are entitled to or have a "right" to sexual pleasure or encourages children to seek out sexual pleasure. Fails to present data on the multiple negative potential outcomes for sexually active children.	Grade 9, Section 5.2 Objective: "List three things that can help a couple to enjoy a long and happy sexual relationship ." (p. 70)
6. PROMOTES SOLO AND/OR MUTUAL MASTURBATION While masturbation can be part of normal child development, encourages masturbation at young ages, which may make children more vulnerable to pornography use, sexual addictions or sexual exploitation. May instruct children on how to masturbate. May also encourage children to engage in mutual masturbation.	"An erect penis will usually go down by itself. Other ways are washing it in cold water, thinking about something else (boring or unpleasant perhaps!), masturbation , if in private, or exercise." (p. 57)
7. PROMOTES CONDOM USE IN INAPPROPRIATE WAYS May inappropriately eroticize condom use (e.g., emphasizing sexual pleasure or "fun" with condoms) or use sexually explicit methods (i.e., penis and vagina models, seductive role plays, etc.) to promote condom use to children. May provide medically inaccurate information on condom effectiveness and omit or deemphasize failure rates. May imply that condoms will provide complete protection against pregnancy or STIs.	No evidence found.

8. PROMOTES PREMATURE	Grade 4, Section 3.2 teacher tips: "Explain that we need to learn about these
SEXUAL AUTONOMY	things so that we can make good decisions about sex." (p. 55)
Teaches children they can choose to have sex when they feel they are ready or when they	"Make up a story to show three reasons why a young boy and girl made a baby while in grade five . Give one way to prevent this for each of the reasons." (p. 58)
find a trusted partner. Fails to provide data about the well- documented negative	Grade 7, Chapter 6 Aim: "To motivate and equip learners to make clear, strong and informed decisions about sexual activity and protect themselves from HIV, STIs and unwanted pregnancy." (p. 63)
consequences of early sexual debut. Fails to encourage sexually active children to return to abstinence.	Grade 7, Section 6.3 Objectives: "Ask each other helpful questions to make a decision on whether to have sex or not ; Make clear, strong and informed decisions about sexual activity." (p. 63)
9. FAILS TO ESTABLISH ABSTINENCE AS THE EXPECTED	Children from 9 to 14 years: "We can help them to develop skills and virtues by covering the below topics:
STANDARD Fails to establish abstinence (or	 coping with sexual feelings, saying no to unwanted touch and sex. choices for avoiding high-risk sex, with a focus on abstinence, but information about staying with one partner and condoms." (p. 9)
a return to abstinence) as the expected standard for all school age children. May mention abstinence only in passing.	"It is not helpful to tell young people that they must abstain from sex until they marry if many will not manage this and if marriage will not protect them. We need to apply information to the reality of our lives as well as talking about virtues and visions of how we might like things to be." (p. 13)
May teach children that all sexual activity—other than "unprotected" vaginal and oral	"Help learners to understand both the positive and negative points of abstinence fully so that they can make informed decisions." (p. 13)
sex—is acceptable, and even healthy. May present abstinence and "protected" sex as equally good options for children.	"Encourage learners not to judge the letter writers with the problem, but to empathise with them. They should be realistic about alternative sources of income for Anna, the needs of her family and the impact on her life chances if she drops out of school. They should consider all her options, which could include having low risk sex using a condom ." (p. 62)
	"Thinking about abstaining from sex: It is not helpful to dismiss the negative points about abstinence unless they are factually incorrect. Help learners to understand both the positive and negative points fully so that they can make informed decisions. This needs to include at least the possibility of practicing low risk sexual activities such as sex with a condom." (p. 63)
	"List three reasons why it is best to abstain from sex or use contraceptives rather than have an abortion." (p. 64)
	"Balance of power: Some examples – education, avoiding high-risk sexual activities and having a source of income increase power for both males and females." (p. 69)
	Grade 9, Chapter 5 Aim: "To motivate and equip learners to avoid risky sexual

F	
	behaviour and to prepare for a happy and safe marriage at the right time." (p. 70)
	"Remind learners that it is best to avoid pregnancy by abstaining or using contraceptives ." (p. 72)
	Grade 9, Section 7.3 Objective: "Name three ways to protect themselves and others from STIs and HIV." (p. 72)
10. P ROMOTES T RANSGENDER IDEOLOGY	No evidence found.
Promotes affirmation of and/or exploration of diverse gender identities. May teach children they can change their gender or identify as multiple genders, or may present other unscientific and medically inaccurate theories. Fails to teach that most gender-confused children resolve their confusion by adulthood and that extreme gender confusion is a mental health disorder (gender dysphoria) that can be helped with mental health intervention.	
11. PROMOTES CONTRACEPTION/ABORTION TO	For children from 15 years and above - "Cover the below topics: contraception , coping with pregnancy, fertility." (p. 9)
CHILDREN	
CHILDREN Presents abortion as a safe or positive option while omitting data on the many potential negative physical and mental	"Discussions on avoiding HIV, STI and pregnancy need to include at least the possibility of practicing low risk sexual activities such as using a condom . Explain to learners that condoms are about 90% effective if they are used correctly and consistently every time. They are not 100% effective, because they can slip off or, very occasionally, break." (p. 13)
health consequences. May teach children they have a right to abortion and refer them to abortion providers. May encourage the use of contracentives, while failing to	"People have different views on abortion but in reality many unsafe abortions are done each year and this harms and kills women. In Zambia, abortion is legal if three medical doctors agree that to continue the pregnancy would damage the physical or mental health of the mother and give their permission for an abortion. A properly performed abortion is safe . Often people with more money can buy a safe abortion whilst poor people have unsafe abortions.
contraceptives, while failing to present failure rates or side effects.	Provide learners with correct information about abortion and post-abortion care but also allow them to talk about their feelings about abortion. Be clear that some people feel it is immoral, whilst others think the woman has a right to decide because it is her body." (p. 38)
	Grade 5, Section 7.3 Objective: "Mention two differences between a safe and an

	unsafe abortion." (p. 58)
	"Many people disapprove of abortion but it still happens. In Zambia, people who have money can buy a safe abortion but poor people often have unsafe abortions. Provide learners with correct information but also allow them to talk about the moral aspects of abortion, without being judgmental yourself." (p. 58)
	Grade 7, Section 7.1 Objective: "Assertively explain to a friend why it is good to use a contraceptive if you are having sex but do not want to have a baby at this time." (p. 64)
	"List three reasons why it is best to abstain from sex or use contraceptives rather than have an abortion." (p. 64)
	Grade 9, Section 6.1 Objectives: "Name three ways that people use to avoid pregnancy which do not work and explain why; Name three ways to avoid pregnancy that do work and explain why." (p. 71)
	Grade 9, Section 6.1 Objective: "Explain to a couple who do not want to have a child at this time the advantages of modern contraceptives and where is the best place to obtain them." (p. 71)
	Grade 9, Section 6.6 Objective: "Name two reasons why girls should not have unsafe abortions." (p. 72)
	"Learners may want to discuss moral issues in relation to abortion. People have different views on the rights of the mother and baby in different situations, but the reality is that many unsafe abortions are done each year and this harms women. Be clear that a properly performed abortion is safe but some people may feel it is immoral whilst others think the woman has a right to decide because it is her body." (p. 72)
12. PROMOTES PEER-TO-PEER SEX ED OR SEXUAL RIGHTS ADVOCACY	Children from 9 to 14 years: "We can help them to develop skills and virtues by covering the below topics: children's rights and how to ask for their fulfilment ." (p. 9)
May train children to teach other children about sex or sexual pleasure, through peer- to-peer initiatives. May recruit children as spokespeople to	"Many teenagers are sexually active and they may not be given or accept the information and services they need to stay safe. They need to know everything they can about sexual and reproductive health and how to stay safe. Teenagers want to be taken seriously and given responsibility. They can become peer educators or join clubs and help the community." (p. 9)
advocate for highly controversial sexual rights (including a right to CSE itself) or to promote	"Work with peer educators to provide lessons to older, more experienced learners." (p. 9)
abortion.	"We can use illustrations to achieve our learning objectives by advocating for rights and support ." (p. 48)
	Grade 6, Section 1.6 Objective: "Give two reasons why young people need to

	learn about sexuality and life-skills at primary school." (p. 60)
	Grade 6, Section 2.5 Objectives: "Name three rights with examples about sexual and reproductive health ; Act a role-play to show a situation where these rights are met or where they are not met; Tell one other person about a right that is not met for some children and what they would like to happen." (p. 60)
	Grade 6, Section 2.6 Objectives: "Identify a right for young people and name the different people who can help to uphold that right; Suggest ways to solve problems where rights are not met; Courageously take action to promote rights in the community ." (p. 60)
	Grade 9, Section 7.3 Objective: "Share knowledge about condom use with friends and family." (p. 72)
13. UNDERMINES TRADITIONAL VALUES AND BELIEFS	"Use the findings to sensitise all the important groups of people , including leaders, service providers, religious leaders, parents /carers, NGOs, government officers, media and businesses. Help them to understand how sexuality and life-
May encourage children to question their parents' beliefs or their cultural or religious values regarding sex, sexual orientation or gender identity.	skills education can benefit their young people and their own lives." (p. 15) "Learners may find it strange to discuss good and bad points about traditional culture because they have been brought up to believe that culture is given by the elders and not to be questioned. Explain that culture is always changing in all societies and people have the power to strengthen helpful parts and change
	harmful parts for the better as they adapt to the changing environment." (p. 61) "In the debates, provide correct information and challenge harmful attitudes before learners vote. Aim to strengthen the good parts of customary laws and change the harmful parts." (p. 67)
14. UNDERMINES PARENTS OR PARENTAL RIGHTS May instruct children they have rights to confidentiality and privacy from their parents. May teach children about accessing sexual commodities or services,	"Teachers and learners are used to a curriculum across rigid subject lines – for example, English, Maths and so on. In the integrated, or cross-curricular approach, the topics are defined by the subject syllabus but not taught rigidly along the subject lines. Sexuality and life-skills is a cross-cutting subject ; therefore we can teach it across the subject lines. This is necessary because, currently 'sexuality and life-skills' does not have an allocation on the national syllabus. It also ensures that the topics are embedded in subjects that schools, learners and parents find important ." (p. 17)
including abortion, without parental consent. May instruct children not to tell their parents what they are being taught about sex in school.	 "How do we integrate sexuality and core subjects? Teachers need to be creative and find opportunities to integrate the subject into the core curriculum. We can find ways to link either the topic or the virtues and skills or both into the core curriculum. For example: In English, learners may be asked to read a story and then solve a problem in the story. They could use one of the problem stories in 'Our future' to do this. When all grades have community studies, it will be easy to integrate a lot of the topics and activities from 'Our future' into the curriculum.

	 In science, learners may be required to know how a germ can go from one person to another. The teacher could use STIs or HIV as an example of a germ to answer this question and then ask learners to use this knowledge to suggest how a young person could protect themselves from this germ. In social development, learners might be asked to carry out an investigation into social reasons for a problem. They could do this about a harmful practice that helps to spread HIV, STIs or unwanted pregnancy." (p. 17) The process for integrating sexuality education into core subjects is outlined for teachers. (p. 18) "You may teach sexuality and life-skills lessons within a core curriculum subject or as a stand-alone lesson. Either way, the objectives achieved with the learning activities should cut across the core and sexuality and life-skills curriculum." (p. 20) Note: Are parents aware that sexuality education is being embedded into all core subjects of education? This makes it virtually impossible for parents to monitor what is taught and how it aligns with their values.
15. REFERS CHILDREN TO HARMFUL RESOURCES	Grade 9, Section 7.3 Objective: "Identify the best source of condoms in their locality ." (p. 72)
Refers children to harmful websites, materials or outside entities. May also specifically refer children to Planned Parenthood or their affiliates or partners for their lucrative services or commodities (i.e., sexual counseling, condoms, contraceptives, gender hormones, STI testing and treatment, abortions, etc.) Please Note: A conflict of interest exists whenever an	Teachers are referred to multiple resources published by Planned Parenthood and the International HIV/AIDS Alliance. (p. 75)
entity that profits from sexualizing children is involved in creating or implementing sex education programs.	
(For more information on how Planned Parenthood sexualizes children for profit see <u>www.WaronChildren.orq</u> and	

www.InvestigateIPPF.org)	
For the complete text of Teaching	Sexuality and Life Skills, see
https://hivhealthclearinghouse.unesc	co.org/sites/default/files/resources/bie_alliance_teaching_sexuality_and_lifeskills_554b_
<u>en.pdf</u> .	